

## STUDIJŲ KOKYBĖS VERTINIMO CENTRAS

# Vilniaus verslo kolegijos STUDIJŲ PROGRAMOS TRANSPORTO VERSLO VADYBA (valstybinis kodas - 653N18007) VERTINIMO IŠVADOS

# EVALUATION REPORT OF TRANSPORT BUSINESS MANAGEMENT (state code -653N18007) STUDY PROGRAMME at Vilnius Business College

**Review' team:** 

- 1. Prof. Andreas Knorr (team leader), academic,
- 2. Mr. Nicholas Coleman, academic,
- 3. Dr. Igors Graurs, academic,
- 4. Mr. Remigijus Šeris, representative of social partners,
- 5. Mr. Linas Misevičius, students' representative.

Evaluation coordinator – Ms. Dovilė Žeimienė.

Išvados parengtos anglų kalba Report language – English

## DUOMENYS APIE ĮVERTINTĄ PROGRAMĄ

Studijų programos pavadinimas	Transporto verslo vadyba
Valstybinis kodas	653N18007
Studijų sritis	Socialiniai mokslai
Studijų kryptis	Verslas
Studijų programos rūšis	Koleginės studijos
Studijų pakopa	Pirmoji
Studijų forma (trukmė metais)	Nuolatinė (3), ištęstinė (4)
Studijų programos apimtis kreditais	180
Suteikiamas laipsnis ir (ar) profesinė kvalifikacija	Transporto ir logistikos profesinis bakalauras
Studijų programos įregistravimo data	2013-04-09

## INFORMATION ON EVALUATED STUDY PROGRAMME

Title of the study programme	Transport Business Management
State code	653N18007
Study area	Social Sciences
Study field	Business
Type of the study programme	College studies
Study cycle	First
Study mode (length in years)	Full-time (3), part-time (4)
Volume of the study programme in credits	180
Degree and (or) professional qualifications awarded	Professional Bachelor of Transport and Logistics
Date of registration of the study programme	9 <sup>th</sup> April, 2013

Studijų kokybės vertinimo centras  $\mathbb C$ 

The Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education

I. INTRODUCTION	4
1.1. Background of the evaluation process	4
1.2. General	4
1.3. Background of the HEI/Faculty/Study field/ Additional information	4
1.4. The Review Team	5
II. PROGRAMME ANALYSIS	6
2.1. Programme aims and learning outcomes	6
2.2. Curriculum design	7
2.3. Teaching staff	9
2.4. Facilities and learning resources	11
2.5. Study process and students' performance assessment	12
2.6. Programme management	14
III. RECOMMENDATIONS	
IV. SUMMARY	
V. GENERAL ASSESSMENT	

## I. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1. Background of the evaluation process

The evaluation of on-going study programmes is based on the **Methodology for** evaluation of Higher Education study programmes, approved by Order No 1-01-162 of 20 December 2010 of the Director of the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education (hereafter – SKVC).

The evaluation is intended to help higher education institutions to constantly improve their study programmes and to inform the public about the quality of studies.

The evaluation process consists of the main following stages: 1) self-evaluation and selfevaluation report prepared by Higher Education Institution (hereafter – HEI); 2) visit of the review team at the higher education institution; 3) production of the evaluation report by the review team and its publication; 4) follow-up activities.

On the basis of external evaluation report of the study programme SKVC takes a decision to accredit study programme either for 6 years or for 3 years. If the programme evaluation is negative such a programme is not accredited.

The programme is **accredited for 6 years** if all evaluation areas are evaluated as "very good" (4 points) or "good" (3 points).

The programme is **accredited for 3 years** if none of the areas was evaluated as "unsatisfactory" (1 point) and at least one evaluation area was evaluated as "satisfactory" (2 points).

The programme **is not accredited** if at least one of evaluation areas was evaluated as "unsatisfactory" (1 point).

## 1.2. General

The Application documentation submitted by the HEI follows the outline recommended by the SKVC. Along with the self-evaluation report and annexes, the following additional documents have been provided by the HEI before, during and/or after the site-visit:

No.	Name of the document
1.	Information on students' employability
2.	Places of internships

## 1.3. Background of the HEI/Faculty/Study field/ Additional information

The objective of this report is to evaluate Vilnius Business College's (VVK) "Transport Business Management" (TBM) professional Bachelor's study programme. Transportation and warehousing services forming the backbone of Lithuania's economy with a 13 per cent share of the country's GDP and with the sector is still growing and further internationalizing, there is a clear market niche for trained specialists in this field. Accordingly, VVK, by having introduced the TBM study programme in 2013, actively contributes to the growth and development of Lithuania's economy by producing these graduates. The TBM programme is being offered in a full-time and a part-time format with identical contents.

VVK was founded in 1989 as one of Lithuania's first private institutions of higher education. In 2001, it obtained at the legal status of a college with the right to offer higher education diplomas to its graduates. Apart from its academic offerings, VVK is also in the business of offering trainings and qualification courses for working adults, jobseekers and socially marginalized groups in cooperation with the labour market and social policy agencies of Lithuania.

VVK is subdivided into five administrative departments but not into faculties. It has a strong international focus and currently offers six Bachelor study programmes in the three areas of social sciences, physical sciences and the humanities which are exclusively taught in English and/or Russian. As a result, among VVK's student population, local Lithuanian minorities (Russians, Belarusians, Georgians, Polish) and incoming foreign students are represented in comparatively large numbers. The TBM, which has a three-year full-time variant and a four-year part-time variant with identical contents, part of the social sciences offerings and is taught in two language-specific varieties: A Russian and a Lithuanian one.

VVK actively pursues an internationalisation strategy and has been involved in a number of international exchange programs for students and staff members at the EU level (Erasmus+) and beyond. The college is especially active in attracting incoming students from abroad, including but not limited to other EU member states and the CIS countries. According to its current Strategic Plan 2014-2020 further expanding its international reach is one of VVK's key strategic objectives (<u>http://www.kolegija.lt/dokumentai\_img/VBC\_Strategic\_plan\_2014\_2020.pdf</u>, p. 17). Accordingly, a set of key performance indicators were defined for the number of study programmes taught exclusively in a foreign language, the number joint degree programmes, the percentage of incoming students in the total student population, participation rates for student and staff in international mobility programmes and the percentage of tuitions fee from incoming international students in total tuition fee revenues.

### 1.4. The Review Team

The review team was completed according *Description of experts' recruitment*, approved by order No. 1-01-151 of Acting Director of the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education. The Review Visit to HEI was conducted by the team on 25th April, 2017.

- **1. Dr. Andreas Knorr (team leader)**, Professor of Economics: Economic Policy and Transport Policy, German University of Public Administration Sciences Speyer, Germany;
- **2.** Mr. Nicholas Coleman, lecturer, Course Leader for Aviation Management, London Metropolitan University, United Kingdom;
- **3.** Dr. Igors Graurs, Rector of Transport and Telecommunication Institute, Coordinator of Development Projects in Latvian Agriculture University (until 2016), Latvia;
- **4.** Mr. Remigijus Šeris, Chief executive officer, JSC Lithuanian Radio and Television Center, Lithuania;
- **5.** Mr. Linas Misevičius, student of ISM University of Management and Economics study programme International Marketing and Management, Lithuania.

Evaluation coordinator – Ms. Dovilė Žeimienė.

## **II. PROGRAMME ANALYSIS**

#### 2.1. Programme aims and learning outcomes

Both the TBM's six programme aims and twenty learning outcomes are well documented in the SER (pp. 6-7) and they are also published in full on VVK's dedicated study programme website (http://www.kolegija.lt/dokumentai\_img/Learning\_outcomes\_TVV.pdf; all\_internet\_sources quoted in this report were last accessed June 4<sup>th</sup>, 2017). Both are therefore fully accessible and transparent to all interested parties, especially the key stakeholders, i.e. enrolled students, prospective students, their parents, and social partners including employers.

The TBM study programme's aims, which are identical for both the full-time and the part-time version of the programme, are subdivided into two general and four professional ones. As for the general one, the programme aims are to train, at the professional bachelor's level, qualified transport <u>business and management</u> (emphasis added by the review team) specialists with entrepreneurship competencies are able to work independently as well as in teams, and who are capable of analytical, systematic and critical thinking who are also aware of the need for continuous lifelong learning and self-development. As for the four programme aims which refer to professional competencies, the focus is on proficiency in at least two foreign languages, an understanding of the domestic and international legal and transport policy framework for commercial transport and logistics activities, transport and logistics-related data collection and processing capabilities, knowledge of transport processes throughout the entire value chain of the industry with a view to initiate innovations through the proficient use of market analysis and management tools.

The programme aims must then be broken down to and implemented through adequate learning outcomes which, in turn, require a variety of custom-tailored teaching, learning and assessment methods to instil in students the necessary skills, competences and know-how to be able to act as good professional specialists in the job market. As are the programme aims, learning outcomes are identical for the full-time and the part-time variants of the study programme.

The reviewers found that the programme aims and learning outcomes are logically consistent, well-defined, clearly formulated and carefully derived from and designed to fulfil VVK's mission which is to "enhance opportunities for professional and personal development for all students by flexibly combining high standard studies" and so to train graduates according to the real-life business needs and innovative learning methods, and to promote among them the ideas of sustainable development and life-long learning. Both are also very clearly and transparently mapped to study methods and assessment method in the syllabi (for a good summary see Annex 10 to the SER, pp. 228-235).

The reviewers also found – based on the interviews and desktop analysis of all relevant documents - that the TBM programme's aims and learning outcomes also fit well into and contribute strongly to eventually implementing VVK's Strategic Plan 2014-2020, in particular in the areas of internationalisation and in fostering students' and graduates' self-development skills.

The review could verify that programme aims and learning outcomes are fully in line with international standards in the area of transport and logistics-related Bachelor' studies programmes which have a focus on the business/management (as opposed to the technical-engineering) side of the field. Accordingly, the title of the TBM study programme clearly reflects these specific programme aims and learning outcomes. Given the fact that the programme is taught in a Russian and a Lithuanian variant and that training in two foreign languages is an integral part of the curriculum, the programme is designed to prepare graduates also for the option of an international career track in the transport and logistic business.

Due to the strict adhesion to all pertinent legal requirements and through the continuous and comprehensive formalized stakeholder feedback procedures, programme management ensures that all relevant state, local and labour market needs are adequately considered in their definition. In this context the reviewers hold it is particularly noteworthy, that programme management and stakeholder are fully aware of Lithuania's official long-term development strategy for the transport business and the rapidly growing importance of ICT use in creating "smart" transport and logistics processes and have attempted to align programme goals and learning outcomes continuously with the respective requirements to ensure high levels of employability among graduates. Moreover, the review team was able to verify in its interviews during the on-site visit that all relevant stakeholders – in particular lecturers and students - are familiar with both the programme aims and the learning outcomes.

Currently, a total of twenty learning outcomes – six referring to the acquisition of general competences and fourteen reflecting professional competencies - exist to ensure the effective delivery of the TBM's programme aims (SER, pp. 6-7; http://www.kolegija.lt/dokumentai\_img/Learning\_outcomes\_TVV.pdf).

The review team acknowledges that these twenty learning outcomes - and hence the academic and practical skills, competences and know-how which have been acquired by graduates upon the completion of the programme - correspond well to the formal, the academic and professional requirements of a level 6 study programme and especially to those of a professional Bachelor's degree. In particular, the clear distinction between general and professional competencies is a good approach in principle to clarify and to effectively communicate expectations to students and lecturers alike.

However, the review also found that future reviews of the study programme should be conducted (also) with the view to reduce the existing complexity at the level of learning outcomes by bringing their number down to a more manageable figure (without giving up the useful distinction between general and professional ones). In short, a lower number would on the one hand make it much easier for programme management and lecturers alike to avoid unnecessary redundancies and to use differentiated teaching, learning and assessment methods for their effective delivery. On the other hand, this complexity reduction would improve the awareness and understanding among students of what learning outcomes exist and how they are delivered and assessed by lecturers.

## 2.2. Curriculum design

As was well documented in the SER, and verified by the review team before and during the onsite visits, all legal requirements for a level 6 study programme in Lithuania are fulfilled by the TBM programme. In terms of ECTS, the TBM's scope is 180 credit points, both for its full-time which takes three years to complete, and its part-time variant which is four years long. The total number of study hours is identical for both variants and stands at 4.860 for each. In the full-time variant, ECTS credits are evenly spread out throughout every study year and amount to 60 ECTS/year. With respect to individual semesters, however, the first, third and fifth semesters earn student 27 ECTS each, while the second, fourth and sixth earn 33 ECTS each. The review holds that this is a good reflection of slightly the different student workloads during individual semesters. For the part-time variant, ECTS credits are evenly spread out at 45 ECTS/year but are more differentiated with respect to individual semesters with minimum of 18 ECTS in the seventh semester and a maximum of 27 ECTS in the eighth semester. Based on its desktop research of the curriculum (in particular the syllabi and the teaching, learning and assessment methods used by lecturers in their courses) and the interviews with lecturers, students and graduates, the review team is satisfied that all programme goals and learning outcomes have so far been well achieved within the stated number of overall study hours, which is also due to the appropriately differentiated ECTS workloads.

The review team found the information provided by programme management on the curriculum and the syllabus in the SER and its Annexes well-structured, very detailed and informative. All relevant curriculum information is also made available to students in print and online. Moreover, lecturers provide all relevant information one more time at the beginning of each course. The generally good access to curriculum- and assessment-related information was confirmed by students and graduates in the interviews during the on-site visit.

Based on their analysis of the SER (including its pertinent Annexes) and their interviews with stakeholder groups, the review team concluded, first, that the TBM programme's course contents, syllabi and delivery methods are fully in line with the academic requirements for a first-cycle, level 6 professional Bachelor's programme. The review team concluded, second, that – throughout the entire curriculum – the TBM Programme does not only offer a well-balanced and comprehensive mix of three strongly intertwined components - general competencies to develop personal and social skills in students, transport- and logistics-related sector-specific knowledge, and management and entrepreneurship skills and know-how – which are complemented by foreign language training.

The reviewers also found the proportion between theoretically based academic contents and practical training and their deep integration throughout the curriculum a very effective approach to achieving the programme aims and learning outcomes. The good relation between contact hours and independent study hours are conducive to effectively realize the student-centred and project-based learning approach in the delivery of the programme.

In this context, the variety and overall fitness for purpose of delivery methods was also verified by the review team; it found them to be reasonable and adequate for a level 6 studies programme in the area of transport and logistics business and with respect to achieving programme aims and, eventually, learning outcomes. In particular, the strong emphasis on self-study, both individually and, primarily, by group work supported by consultations was considered by the reviewers to be a strong point of the programme's curriculum design. This is also true of the part-time variant of the TBM which adequately addresses the specific needs of part-time students by the combination of contact hours and comprehensive self-study components with online delivery through elearning and blended learning methods.

Reviewers found minimal content overlap between courses (both in the SER and in their interviews with stakeholders). This reflects well programme management's and lecturer's continuous efforts to deliver a well-synchronized sequencing in the delivery of the programme. Generally speaking, the curriculum's sequencing allows for the gradual acquisition of skills, competences and know-how, starting out with a robust theoretical foundation which gives way to more and more practical contents as students move from the first year of study to towards their graduation.

In close cooperation with social partners, the curriculum has been reviewed annually since it was first offered in 2017. Social partners, VVK's leadership and programme management described their interaction as a "continuous dialogue and feedback process" in their interviews with the review team during the on-site visit. Moreover, the manifold research and practical project activities of the vast majority of lecturers ensure that state-of-the-art theoretical, empirical and practical knowledge and methodologies, as well as case studies, are continuously integrated into the curriculum (examples for these activities will be given under item 2.3. Teaching staff).

The review team found that room for improvement exists with respect to the quality and quantity foreign language training within the curriculum. While the reviewers do acknowledge and praise programme management in principle for their efforts to incorporate foreign language proficiency prominently into the study programme, because it will be very conducive to promoting graduates' job market prospects against the backdrop of an increasingly internationalizing transport and logistics industry, more efforts need to be undertaken to achieve actually deliver in this part of the curriculum.

The reviewers identified several shortcomings with respect to TBM-related foreign language training – both, though minor, with respect to both the first foreign language (English) and, more serious ones, regarding the second foreign language (students have a rather large number of foreign languages to choose from, including Chines, French, German and Spanish).

To begin with, English language training – the first foreign language in the curriculum - is only offered during the first two years in the full-time variant (respectively during the first 5 semesters of the part-time variant). Professional English is only taught in the second year of the full-time variant (and in the fourth and fifth semesters of the part-time variant). Programme management should therefore consider making the first foreign language mandatory throughout the entire duration of the study programme to achieve higher overall levels of proficiency. This change to the curriculum should be complemented by a standardized formal language proficiency test (e.g. TOEFL) which students must pass as part of the entrance procedure to give programme management detailed information of the proficiency levels of freshmen; this information, would, in turn help programme management to better align English language training to the different proficiency levels of students.

With respect to the second foreign language, the review team learned in the interviews that courses are almost exclusively focused on imparting on students general language skills only, while specific programme-relevant language skills are notably absent from the curriculum. This is due to the fact that the language courses are not exclusively offered for TBM students but are open to students from all other study programmes.

## 2.3. Teaching staff

As for the academic staff who are involved as lecturers in the TBM programme, all legal requirements of Lithuania are fulfilled. This includes the recruiting procedures for new lecturers – by competition for 5 (potentially renewable) year contracts - which are made fully transparent to potential candidates (and which were also made transparent to the review team). VVK ensures that suitable candidates are both academically qualified and practically experienced to teach and to do research and project work in their respective specialisations.

To provide more detail, according to the SER (pp. 15f. and Annex 3), all lecturers have acquired a tertiary level qualification, i.e. at least a Master's degree or an equivalent formal qualification; ten hold the degree of Doctor of Science (i.e. 29.1 per cent). As was verified by the analysis of their CVs by the review team, 73.3 per cent have at least three years of practical experience in a field which is relevant to their teaching areas in the TBM study programme. This ratio clearly exceed the legal requirement of fifty per cent by a wide margin. Most lecturers are involved in academic and/or practical projects and have regular access to and/or completed staff development measures such as conference presentations of their own programme-related (and other) research output and staff mobility programmes. In the interviews with lecturers, the reviewers also found the lecturers' foreign language proficiency, including in English, to be very good overall.

As for the age distribution, the average age of the 34 lecturers who are active in the TBM programme currently stands at 46 years which also corresponds roughly to the lecturers' median age. Overall, given the well-balanced mix of older, middle-aged and younger lecturers and their respective professional and academic backgrounds (as evidenced by their CVs and through the interviews conducted by the review team), the lecturer team does provide the broad range of academic qualifications and practical experience which are required to deliver the TBM programme in line with all defined programme aims and the learning outcomes.

The ratio of lecturers to students -1:2.62 (for the year 2016/17) - is excellent and has remained pretty stable since the programme was started.

Staff turnover is at very low level which has so far guaranteed the stable delivery of the TBM programme over time. As lecturers have plenty of options of employment at other higher education institutions in Vilnius, this is a good indication of high levels of overall staff satisfaction. This good impression was confirmed in the interviews the review team conducted with all stakeholder groups. Job satisfaction was at very high levels overall in particular because of the "we are family"-approach of VVK's leadership and programme management which earned a lot of praise from lecturers (as well as, independently, form all other stakeholder groups, i.e. students, administrative staff, graduates and social partners).

Nevertheless, a low turnover rate may potentially contribute in the long run to somewhat 'sclerotize' the lecturer corps. This may eventually result in outdated delivery methods and lack of exposure to state-of the art academic and practical knowledge. Obviously, for this specific programme should only be a concern if the number of (equally or even better qualified) new recruits falls substantially below the number of lecturers who leave, and if no adequate staff development measures are available. As the evidence to the contrary in the SER (pp. 16-17, and, in full detail, Annex 6) demonstrates, there is currently no reason at all for concern in this area at the moment. This is because ample opportunities exist for staff development of all sorts, including staff mobility programs and internships in business, project work, conference participations and other forms of professional and personal development exist (e.g. through the EU-sponsored IDEATE platform), which are also used on a regular basis by the majority of the teaching staff.

Examples include staff mobility activities by 8 lecturers who teach in the TBM programme in the 102-2016 period, essentially within the ERASMUS+ to partner universities in Poland, Latvia, Slovenia, Georgia and Germany (complemented by 19 incoming visiting professors from VVK's partner institutions in the EU and Turkey), staff development measures in the area of internal quality assurance, and applied research project work for Lithuanian business associations and transport and logistics businesses. In addition, VVK hosts and organises a biannual international conference on "Innovative formation technologies for science, business and education" which is also open to lecturers (and students) of the TBM programme to present their research and experience in this area.

Finally, TBM lecturers published 8 articles on their own programme-related research during the review period in study programme-relevant academic journals. If the number of publications of external lecturers, who only teach part-time in the TBM programme, were also counted, the publications output would be substantially higher, but these additional publications cannot, as a matter of fact, be originally be attributed to VVK's teaching staff. However, it is noteworthy in this context that their (part-time) employment also at VVK ensures a permanent flow of their own high-level research into the curriculum of the TBM study programme as well.

The review team therefore concludes that VVK's management incl. the TBM's programme management make adequate precautions so that lecturers remain fully qualified to deliver in terms of the TBM's programme aims and learning outcomes.

## 2.4. Facilities and learning resources

During the on-site visit, the review team inspected VVK's generic and programme-related facilities and learning resources to verify the information which was provided in the SER (pp. 19-21). The reviewers found no reasons to complain about the quantity and quality -i.e. the size and the available technical and other equipment - of the classrooms and the labs which are used for the TBM programme and which are all in the same building. More specifically, three large lecture rooms for 50-60 students are available. They are complemented by five mid-sized lecture rooms which have space for 15 to 22 students. All classrooms are equipped with state-of-the-art audio-visual teaching infrastructure.

In addition, four computer labs with 9 to 24 workstations are available; these facilities are also open to all students outside classes during their individual study hours. Another 11 PC work stations are available in the library, plus 12 in the reading room. As all computer work station are a shared resource among all students of all of VVK's study programmes, it is important to that the ratio of students to available computers is a good 18:1 (a figure which has remained rather stable since 2013). Finally, students are offered a large recreation area which is equipped with free Wi-Fi access (which is offered all across VVK's facilities) and a free water fountain. The review team found the entire facility aesthetically very appealing and very-well designed. Although the facilities are located in the upper floors of a multi-story building, classrooms and library are also fully accessible to handicapped students.

In order to ensure the adequate delivery of the practical components of the TBM programme, students are offered comprehensive training to familiarize them with all major state-of-the art standard software packages which are used by transport and logistics business (.e. Akis, Speda and Autoroute). Close cooperation have also been established with transport and logistics companies of the Vilnius region to offer TBM students a broad range of practical training including internship opportunities at the respective company sites, e.g. Girteka Logistics, Easting Express, UAB Jumisa and Pecatum. Frequently internship have resulted in project-based Bachelor theses.

VVK's on-site library is the principal access point for student and lecturers to generic and programme-related academic literature, databases (e.g. EBSCO, Taylor & Francis and Emerald Management eJournals Collection) and other relevant print and online resources such as e-books and e-periodicals. Adequate seating is provided at all time including examination periods and students expressed their overall satisfaction with the opening hours. The library is well-stocked with generic but also TBM-relevant learning and research resources, i.e. textbooks, academic and practitioners' journals, transportation-, logistics- and business-related databases and software solutions which are fully accessible to students and - wherever relevant for individual courses - via MODDLE. Because the TBM's language of instruction is Russian in one of the two study programme variants, it is also noteworthy in this context that access to all programme-relevant Russian language publications is also ensured. In addition, VVK is also a full member of the Lithuanian Research Library Consortium (LRLC) which allow it to share resource with other higher education institution members throughout Lithuania.

Lecturers as well as full-time and part-time students have access to a "Virtual Learning Environment" (e.g. a MOODLE-type online platform) to share teaching materials and assignments but also to carry out online discussion among students and lecturers. Students and

lecturers confirmed in the interviews conducted during this online facility is widely and regularly used in in TBM study programme.

Due to the inner city location of the campus, there is no need for VVK their own hostel facilities, canteen service and sports facilities to students or staff, although partnerships exist with other local colleges and universities.

## 2.5. Study process and students' performance assessment

Admission to the TBM study programme is by means of transparent and publicly available admission regulations and procedures. These rules, and a list of the documents which applicants need to submit, are also made available to all interest parties, including prospective foreign students, on VVK's website (<u>http://www.kolegija.lt/en/studijos/documents-to-be-submited/142;</u> <u>http://www.kolegija.lt/en/studijos/admission-criteria/143</u>) and are in line with the general legal (minimum) admission requirements which apply to all higher education institutions in Lithuania.

The highest/lowest entrance score in the academic year 2016/17 was 2.44/1.04 for full-time students and 4.28/1.12 for part-time students; the average scores were 1.83/2.39. Over time, average score for the full-time variant decreased slightly, while they increased for the part-time variant.

The success rate, i.e. the ratio between graduates and admitted students for the first complete cohort of graduates was 0.43 for the Lithuanian and a much better 0.8 for the Russian variant of the TBM study programme (the data are for the 2015/16 graduation, the first ever, while more recent data for the 2016/17 graduation are not yet available). This translates into a (high) 57 per cent vs. a (low) twenty per cent dropout rate, respectively.

VVK continuously monitors students' academic progress and dropout rates. It also attempts to systematically to elicit and analyse drop-out reasons. According to the collected data, around half the drop-outs – both in the full-time and the part-time variant - are due to underachievement, while academic leave due to problems to effectively combine studies and employment or family obligations rank second. According to the data in the SER (p. 24f.) and the interviews which were conducted by the reviewers, a small majority of those students who are on academic leave has returned later to VVK, although not always to the TBM study programme; however, in some case, dropouts from other VVK study programmes became later enrolled in to the TBM.

To address the dropout issue, the review team learned in the interviews with students and graduates, that VVK goes to great lengths to assist students by offering substantial flexibility with respect to tuition fee payments and the scheduling of classes and examinations to assist them in accommodating their studies with the specific requirement of their work schedules and/or family requirements. All students and graduates praised management and teaching and administrative staff for their strong commitment and "we are family"-approach to try to find suitable, individual solutions.

The study process is organized in such a manner that the study plan allows all students to study curriculum, in principle, in the correct sequence and within the specified time frame so that all programme aims and learning outcomes will be achieved. Theoretical and practical contents are synchronized well in all study years, both in the full-time and part-time variants of the TLB study programme. However, some students and graduates argued that the internship time should be extended and that the internship should be move forward in the curriculum. This notwithstanding, students reported no difficulty in finding adequate internship place and gave praise for the very good cooperation with VVK, the TBM programme management and social partners in this respect.

Information technology is increasingly used to monitor student's academic process but also to offer them continuous guidance during their studies. E.g. a dedicated student information system (MANO VVK) was created which gives students full access to their assessment results and which also provides them with a personal student email address. Students also share information and communicate with lecturer through this platform.

In addition to the aforementioned study process-related ICT infrastructure, VVK offers students good variety of academic and social support measures. First of all, a number of financial study aids, e.g. scholarships, grants etc. are available and VVK's student services assist students throughout the application process (<u>http://www.kolegija.lt/en/studentams/study-aid/13</u>). In addition, lecturers supervise students' academic progress with a mix of mandatory and on demand consultations; VVK also maintains contact with students' parents and social partners, especially before and during internships. Finally, the college assists students in organising events, in particular, but not limited to a socialisation week for freshmen, sports and other recreational events which contribute to establish strong bond among students and between the student community and the college.

The examination rules – the "VBC study results evaluation procedure" - are clear, transparent and made publicly available to all students on the VVK's website. Students are also fully informed about the specific assessment procedures with respect to learning outcomes by lecturers of the TBM study programme, while general assessment rules regarding assessment methods to learning outcomes are also published on VVK's website. Students, who failed an examination, are allowed to retake it within a specified period of time.

A formalized, clear and transparent procedure for complaints and appeals exists – overseen by the "Committee for disputes" - and is communicated to students. Students with handicaps and disabilities are adequately taken care with respect to all aspects of the TBM study programme including examinations. The examination regulations, including rules regarding good academic practice – which are posted on VVK'S website - are made transparent and explain to all students repeatedly throughout their studies. Among the students and graduates the review team interviewed during their site visit, overall satisfaction with the assessment system was high. There were no allegations at of unfair treatment with respect to marking criteria and assessment procedures, and students and graduates were very positive with the feedback they received regularly by lecturers on their academic achievements.

VVK actively encourages all students to participate in local, regional, national and international competitions as well as scientific conferences and seminars (examples, which are of relevance for the TBM study programme, include student participation at student fairs in Belarus at Minsk EXPO, in Azerbaijan at the Azer EDU in Baku, and IDEATE projects at Staffordshire University in the Uk and the University of nova Gorica in Slovenia; for a full list see Annex 8 to the SER).

TBM programme students are offered participation in international student mobility schemes, in particular the Erasmus+ program. In 2016, a total of 5 TBM students have taken the opportunity to study abroad, both in Western and Eastern European countries. By comparison, lecturers' participation in international mobility schemes is slightly higher.

VVK has established the "Office of Communication and Internationals Relations" CIR) which is in charge of running a graduates' employment and career monitoring system. Tracer studies are conducted annually and the results are fed back into the curriculum review process. Moreover, systematic feedback on the employability of graduates is sought from social partners through a variety of channels. In addition, regular conference, workshop and other events are organised to maintain close formal and informal ties with stakeholder, in particular employers. With these measures, VVK's leadership has managed to achieve very good results over an extended period of time in the annual ranking of all Lithuanian higher education institutions in the categories of graduate employability and employer satisfaction.

## 2.6. Programme management

Programme management for the TBM study programme is effective and successfully in ensuring that programme aims and learning outcomes are realized at high levels of achievement. All processes and responsibilities (see SER, pp. 29-32) are described in full details, documented and very well organised in practice. There are also fully in line with the internal definition and distribution of all responsibilities which are also fully transparent to all parties involved in the process. Quality goals and performance indicators exist in all relevant areas; they are also incorporated into the Strategic Plan 2014-2020 with the aim of measuring progress in its implementation. The TBM's programme management is fully embedded into VVK's internal standards quality assurance system. which is based on academic ESG (https://www.hrk.de/uploads/media/ESG\_German\_and\_English\_2015.pdf) in combination with procedural-organisational ISO 9001:2008 standards.

The key player in internal quality assurance system at VVK is the College Academic Board (CAB). Its principal task is to ensure and improve the overall quality of the study process across all study programmes. Implementation is then delegated to the Studies Department which, in turn, supervises the study programme committees activities in the areas of curriculum redesign and study programme improvement. In order to collect as much relevant information as possible from stakeholders, the results of a number of <u>internal and external evaluations and surveys</u> are actively used in the process. These include general student surveys, student evaluations of lecturer's teaching quality, employee surveys, school pupil surveys, prospective students' surveys as well as graduates surveys (tracer studies). In addition, VVK organises regular meeting between students and graduates. Additionally, to review the effectiveness of the internal quality assurance system, an annual internal "Senior Evaluative Analysis" is conducted by the college.

As an integral part of the internal quality assurance procedures, programme management ensures that all relevant curriculum and syllabus information, including entrance, examination and appeals procedures are well-structured, very detailed and informative. They are also fully transparent to all interested parties inside and outside the college as they are made available in print and online formats, and are regularly updated.

To summarize, the review team was able to verify during the on-site visits through document checks and the interviews conducted that the internal quality assurance system is an effective tool which is capable of generating continuous feedback flows from all stakeholders and to effectively process it with the aim of continuously improving internal procedures and study programmes. However, VVK's feedback process could be enhanced to also include regular information gathering from stakeholders representing the political-administrative sphere as well; currently this specific information is not systematically gathered and assessed. This is because most outside feedback is generated from employers and graduates – which is perfectly fine with respect to ensuring the very high levels of employability among graduates. Nevertheless, the review team found that VVK's leadership and the TBM's programme management team might consider to closely involve additional outside stakeholders among key decision-makers in the political and administrative sphere in its regular feedback processes – both in larger numbers and more closely than is the case now. This would produce additional valuable information on (proposed) programme-relevant legislative changes increase VVK's visibility among public

sector and governmental decision-makers as am important contributor to regional economic development, in particular of the Vilnius region.

## **III. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 1. Programme management should continue to take a dynamic perspective on learning outcomes in close cooperation with all stakeholders, especially social partners and graduates/alumni. Accordingly, learning outcomes should be regularly reviewed with social partners with the aim to preserve their adequacy and up-to-dateness, but also with a view to reducing their overall number to more manageable levels. The main benefit of a reduced number of learning outcomes would be that it renders the task of matching them to appropriate teaching, learning and assessment methods less complex than it currently is.
- 2. Foreign language training i.e. with respect to both the first foreign language (English) and the second language (a choice of several offerings) has several shortcomings which should be addressed. First, English language training, including professional English is only part of the curriculum during the first 2 years (full-time variant), respectively the first 5 semesters (part-time variant). Programme management should therefore explore ways to make the first foreign language mandatory throughout the entire duration of the study programme to achieve higher overall levels of proficiency upon graduation. Also, in order to better align language training with the proficiency levels of students from the first semester, a standardized language test (e.g. TOEFL) should be introduced as part of the entrance assessment, and language courses should be designed to reflect the different entry levels. With respect to the second foreign language regardless which is chosen by a student professional terminology currently is pretty much absent for the curriculum because the courses are open for all students regardless of their respective study programmes. This shortcoming should be addressed by programme management by offering TBM students some dedicated and exclusive trainings in this field.
- 3. Programme management should consider involving more public sector decision-makers more closely in its feedback procedures within the framework of its internal quality insurance and curriculum enhancements. This would produce more information on developments in the political-administrative sphere which are or may become relevant in order to achieve programme aims and learning outcomes and/or make adjustments to them over time.

## **IV. SUMMARY**

Overall, VVK's TBM's professional Bachelor's studies programme provides high quality for all stakeholders. In terms of curricular contents, the main feature of the programme is its clear focus on the business and management-related aspects of the transport and logistics markets, including the legal framework at the national and the international level (as opposed to the traditional focus of related study programmes on the technical and engineering aspects of this industry).

Programme aims and learning outcomes are clearly defined in close cooperation with all stakeholders. They are very effectively delivered throughout the curriculum through a good mix of teaching, learning and assessment methods, in particular by means of the very good integration of theoretical and practical components and adequate assessment methods. However, at twenty the sheer number of learning outcomes creates a lot of complexity with respect to ensuring their effective and efficient delivery. The review team therefore recommends reducing their number to a more manageable figure.

The curriculum is well-designed, overlaps are reduced to the didactically necessary minimum and all programme-relevant information is easily accessible for students, prospective students and the public as a whole. The TBM study programme is well-positioned, in principle, to prepare students for the specific requirements of internationalisation in the sector, in particular at the crossroads between Western and Eastern Europe (especially the CIS states) because of its strong focus on the legal framework for international transport and logistics networks and because of the prominent role of foreign language training in the curriculum. However, the effectiveness of foreign language training should be improved, especially with respect to the second foreign language where course only focus on general proficiency levels without introducing students to the professional terminology of the transport and logistics field.

Teaching staff fulfil and partly exceed all legal requirements. Staff development measures are in place and lecturers are actively encouraged to make regular use of them. Teaching staff participation in mobility programmes is high, as are conference participations and involvement in project work. Teach staff turnover is low which reflects high levels of job satisfaction. Nevertheless, programme management should ensure that the current balance between young, middle-aged and very experienced senior lecturers is maintained in the future.

Facilities and learning resources are fully up to the task to effectively delivery the programme. Facilities are also aesthetically appealing, creating a comfortable teaching and learning atmosphere. In particular, students enjoy access to very good computer labs where the use of professional software packages is effectively trained. However, VVK does not provide housing and sports facilities to students due to its inner-city location; still, cooperation agreements with other local higher education institutions exist to offer students at least some alternatives.

Entrance requirements are in line with legal regulations, transparent and publicly accessible. However, the average entrance scores are rather low, while the drop-out rate is high at 56 per cent for the first full-time graduate cohort, although it is low at 20 per cent for the part-timers. VVK attempts to systematically analyse the underlying causes and has reacted with flexible payment schemes for tuition fees as well as through flexible scheduling of classes and examinations. Student support is very good overall – students, graduates and lecturers also have nothing but praise for the "we are family"-attitude of VVK's leadership and all staff members.

Programme management and internal quality assurance are very effective in ensuring that programme aims and learning outcomes are reached and that the curriculum is developed in line with changing labour market needs. All relevant processes are described in full detail and individual responsibilities are precisely assigned and transparent to all stakeholders. The internal quality assurance is very effective in generating and processing highly relevant feedback from stakeholders. However, VVK's transfer performance to the regional economy and the city of Vilnius are not assessed.

## V. GENERAL ASSESSMENT

The study programme Transport Business Management (state code - 653N18007) at Vilnius Business College is given **positive** evaluation.

No.	Evaluation Area	Evaluation of an area in points*
1.	Programme aims and learning outcomes	3
2.	Curriculum design	3
3.	Teaching staff	3
4.	Facilities and learning resources	3
5.	Study process and students' performance assessment	3
6.	Programme management	3
	Total:	18

Study programme assessment in points by evaluation areas.

\*1 (unsatisfactory) - there are essential shortcomings that must be eliminated; 2 (satisfactory) - meets the established minimum requirements, needs improvement;

3 (good) - the field develops systematically, has distinctive features;

4 (very good) - the field is exceptionally good.

Grupės vadovas: Team leader:	Prof. Andreas Knorr
Grupės nariai: Team members:	Mr. Nicholas Coleman
	Dr. Igors Graurs
	Mr. Remigijus Šeris
	Mr. Linas Misevičius

### VILNIAUS VERSLO KOLEGIJOS PIRMOSIOS PAKOPOS STUDIJŲ PROGRAMOS *TRANSPORTO VERSLO VADYBA* (VALSTYBINIS KODAS – 6531LX014, 653N18007) 2017-06-19 EKSPERTINIO VERTINIMO IŠVADŲ NR. SV4-134 IŠRAŠAS

<...>

#### V. APIBENDRINAMASIS ĮVERTINIMAS

Vilniaus verslo kolegijos studijų programa *Transporto verslo vadyba* (valstybinis kodas – 6531LX014, 653N18007) vertinama **teigiamai**.

Eil. Nr.	Vertinimo sritis	Srities įvertinimas, balais*
1.	Programos tikslai ir numatomi studijų rezultatai	3
2.	Programos sandara	3
3.	Personalas	3
4.	Materialieji ištekliai	3
5.	Studijų eiga ir jos vertinimas	3
6.	Programos vadyba	3
	Iš viso	<b>b:</b> 18

\* 1 - Nepatenkinamai (yra esminių trūkumų, kuriuos būtina pašalinti)

2 - Patenkinamai (tenkina minimalius reikalavimus, reikia tobulinti)

3 - Gerai (sistemiškai plėtojama sritis, turi savitų bruožų)

4 - Labai gerai (sritis yra išskirtinė)

<...>

## IV. SANTRAUKA

Apskritai, Vilniaus verslo kolegijos *Transporto verslo vadybos* profesinio bakalauro studijų programa užtikrina aukštą kokybę visoms suinteresuotosioms šalims. Vertinant programos turinį, pagrindinis programos privalumas yra aiškus dėmesys transporto ir logistikos rinkų verslo ir vadybos aspektams, įskaitant šalies ir tarptautinę teisę (priešingai nei susijusiose studijų programose tradiciškai skiriamas dėmesys pramonės techniniams ir inžineriniams aspektams).

Programos tikslai ir studijų rezultatai yra aiškiai apibrėžti glaudžiai bendradarbiaujant su visomis suinteresuotosiomis šalimis. Jie veiksmingai išdėstyti visoje studijų programoje, puikiai derinant dėstymo, studijų ir vertinimo metodus, ypač gerai integruojant teorines ir praktines dalis bei pasirenkant tinkamus vertinimo metodus. Tačiau pats studijų rezultatų skaičius (20) apsunkina veiksmingą ir efektyvų jų siekimą. Todėl ekspertų grupė rekomenduoja sumažinti jų skaičių iki lengviau kontroliuojamo.

Studijų programa gerai suplanuota, dubliavimasis sumažintas iki didaktiškai reikalingo minimumo, visa su programa susijusi informacija lengvai prieinama studentams, būsimiesiems studentams ir plačiajai visuomenei. TVV studijų programa iš principo tinkamai parengia studentus pagal specifinius sektoriaus tarptautiškumo reikalavimus, ypač darbui tarp Vakarų ir Rytų Europos (ypač NVS valstybėse), nes daug dėmesio skiriama tarptautinių transporto ir logistikos tinklų teisiniams aspektams, programoje svarbi vieta skiriama užsienio kalbų studijoms. Tačiau užsienio kalbų dėstymo veiksmingumą galima būtų padidinti, ypač kalbant

apie antrąją užsienio kalbą, kurios kursas orientuotas tik į bendruosius įgūdžius, nesupažindinant studentų su profesine transporto ir logistikos srities terminija.

Dėstytojai atitinka ir iš dalies viršija visus teisinius reikalavimus. Parengtos darbuotojų kvalifikacijos kėlimo priemonės, dėstytojai aktyviai skatinami jomis reguliariai naudotis. Dėstytojų dalyvavimas judumo programose, taip pat dalyvavimas konferencijose ir projektiniuose darbuose yra didelis. Darbuotojų kaita maža – tai rodo aukštą pasitenkinimo darbu lygį. Nepaisant to, programos vadovybė turėtų užtikrinti, kad ateityje būtų išlaikomas dabartinis jaunų, vidutinio amžiaus ir labai patyrusių vyresnių dėstytojų santykis.

Materialieji ištekliai leidžia efektyviai vykdyti programą. Jie taip pat yra estetiškai malonūs, sukuria patogią dėstymo ir studijų atmosferą. Studentai gali naudotis labai gerai įrengtais kompiuterių kambariais, kuriuose efektyviai mokoma naudotis profesionalios programinės įrangos paketais. VVK studentams neteikiamos tik apgyvendinimo ir sporto patalpos, nes kolegija yra miesto centre. Nepaisant to, sudarytos bendradarbiavimo sutartys su kitomis vietos AM, siekiant suteikti studentams bent keletą alternatyvų.

Stojimo reikalavimai atitinka teisinius reikalavimus, yra skaidrūs ir viešai prieinami. Tačiau vidutinis konkursinis balas yra gana žemas, dar pirmame kurse studijas nutraukia daug nuolatinių studentų (56 proc., nors ištęstinių studentų – tik 20 proc.). VVK siekia sistemingai analizuoti pagrindines to priežastis ir į situaciją reagavo sudarydama lanksčias mokėjimo už mokslą programas, taip pat lanksčiau organizuodama užsiėmimus ir egzaminus. Parama studentams labai gera – studentai, absolventai ir dėstytojai gali tik pagirti VVK vadovybės ir visų darbuotojų požiūrį "mes – viena šeima".

Programos vadyba ir vidinis kokybės užtikrinimas atliekami veiksmingai, užtikrinant, kad būtų pasiekiami programos tikslai ir studijų rezultatai ir kad studijų programa būtų parengta atsižvelgiant į besikeičiančius darbo rinkos poreikius. Visi atitinkami procesai išsamiai apibūdinti, individualios atsakomybės paskirstytos tiksliai ir yra aiškiai matomos visoms suinteresuotosioms šalims. Vidinė kokybės užtikrinimo sistema veiksmingai generuoja ir apdoroja svarbius suinteresuotųjų šalių atsiliepimus. Tačiau nebuvo įvertintas VVK rezultatų perkėlimas į regioninę ekonomiką ir Vilniaus miestą.

<...>

## **III. REKOMENDACIJOS**

- Programos vadovybė turėtų išlaikyti dinamišką požiūrį į studijų rezultatus glaudžiai bendradarbiaudama su visomis suinteresuotosiomis šalimis, ypač socialiniais dalininkais ir absolventais. Studijų rezultatai turėtų būti reguliariai peržiūrimi su socialiniais dalininkais, siekiant išlaikyti rezultatų tinkamumą ir naujumą, taip pat jų sumažinti iki lengviau kontroliuojamo skaičiaus. Pagrindinis mažesnio studijų rezultatų skaičiaus privalumas tas, kad juos būtų lengviau derinti su atitinkamais dėstymo, studijų ir vertinimo metodais.
- 2. Užsienio kalbų, t. y. pirmosios užsienio kalbos (anglų kalbos) ir antrosios užsienio kalbos (keli variantai), studijos turi keletą trūkumų, į kuriuos reikėtų atkreipti dėmesį. Pirma, anglų kalba, įskaitant profesinę anglų kalbą, studijų programoje dėstoma tik pirmus 2 metus (nuolatinės studijos) arba pirmus 5 semestrus (ištęstinės studijos). Programos vadovybei reikėtų išnagrinėti, kaip pirmąją užsienio kalbą padaryti privalomą visos studijų programos metu, kad būtų pasiektas aukštesnis bendras išsilavinimo lygis baigiant studijas. Be to, pirmąjį

semestrą norint užsienio kalbų studijas geriau suderinti su studentų gebėjimais, į stojamąjį vertinimą turėtų būti įtrauktas standartizuotas užsienio kalbos egzaminas (pvz., TOEFL), o užsienio kalbų kursai turėtų būti parengti taip, kad atspindėtų skirtingus stojančiųjų gebėjimus. Nepriklausomai nuo pasirinkimo, visose antrųjų užsienio kalbų mokymo metodikose praktiškai nėra jokios profesinės terminijos, nes kursai šiuo metu atviri visiems studentams, nepriklausomai nuo jų studijų programos. Programos vadovybė turėtų spręsti šį trūkumą ir pasiūlyti TVV studentams specializuotus išskirtinius šios srities kursus.

3. Programos vadovybei reikėtų į savo atsiliepimų procedūras įtraukti daugiau viešojo sektoriaus sprendimus priimančių asmenų vidaus kokybei užtikrinti ir studijų programai tobulinti. Taip būtų gauta daugiau informacijos apie pokyčius politinėje ir administracinėje srityse, o tai gali labai praversti siekiant programos tikslų bei studijų rezultatų ir (arba) juos koreguojant.

<...>

Vertėjos rekvizitai (vardas, pavardė, parašas)

Paslaugos teikėjas patvirtina, jog yra susipažinęs su Lietuvos Respublikos baudžiamojo kodekso 235 straipsnio, numatančio atsakomybę už melagingą ar žinomai neteisingai atliktą vertimą, reikalavimais.